

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4
SAM NUNN
ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER
61 FORSYTH STREET
ATLANTA GEORGIA 30303-8960

MAY 2 6 2011

## CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Mr. Joseph Hiden Regional Manager Engel Realty Company, LLC 951 8<sup>th</sup> Street South, Ste 100 Birmingham, Alabama 35216

> Re: Vestawood Apartments LLC Docket No.: TSCA-04-2011-2532(b)

Dear Mr. Hiden:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

As stated in Section V of the CAFO, the assessed penalty of \$2,080 is due within 30 days from the effective date. Please ensure that the face of your cashier's or certified check includes the name of the company and the Docket Number of this case. Penalty payment questions should be directed to Mr. Bryson Lehman either by telephone at (513) 487-2123 or by written correspondence to his attention at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Cincinnati Accounting Operations address identified in the CAFO. Should you have any questions about this matter or their compliance status in the future, please call me at (404) 562-8979 or W. Curtis Richardson at (404) 562-8987.

Also enclosed is a copy of the October 2001 Enforcement Alert titled "U.S. EPA Notifying Defendants of Securities and Exchange Commission's Environmental Disclosure Requirements." This document puts your client on notice of their potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission any environmental enforcement actions taken by EPA.

Sincerely,

Janear M. Gell

Chief

Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

**Enclosures** 

# UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ATLANTA, GEORGIA

| IN THE MATTER OF:         | ) |                                       |    |          |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|----|----------|
| Vestawood Apartments, LLC | ) | Docket No.: TSCA-04-2011-2532(b       |    | £027     |
|                           | ) | P                                     |    | Same b   |
| Respondent.               | ) | ्रिक्<br>इ<br>इ                       | C) | , y      |
|                           | ) | (max)                                 | ** | <u>.</u> |
|                           |   | • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • | Ç  | }        |

#### CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

#### I. Nature of the Action

- This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to Section 16(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA), 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), 40 C.F.R. Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides, and Toxics Management Division, U. S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4. Respondent is Vestawood Apartments, LLC.
- 2. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

#### II. Preliminary Statements

- 3. The Administrator of EPA promulgated regulations at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F under the authority of Section 1018 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, 42 U.S.C. § 4852d, also known as Title X of the Housing and Community Development Act of 1992. Pursuant to Title X, it is a prohibited act under Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689, for any person to fail or refuse to comply with a provision of Title X or any rule or order issued under Title X.
- 4. For purposes of enforcing Title X under TSCA, the penalty for each violation applicable under Section 16 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615, shall not be more than \$10,000. The Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1996 requires EPA to review and adjust penalties, as necessary, for inflation at least once every four years. As such, pursuant to the Adjustment of Civil Monetary Penalties for Inflation Rule, 40 C.F.R. Part 19, the revised maximum penalty for each violation occurring after January 30, 1997, through January 12, 2009, is \$11,000 and for each violation occurring after January 12, 2009, the maximum penalty is \$16,000.
- 5. The authority to take action under Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under TSCA to EPA Region 4 by EPA Delegation 12-2-A, dated May 11, 1994. The Regional Administrator, Region 4, has redelegated this authority to the Director, Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division, by EPA Region 4 Delegation 12-2-A. Pursuant to the aforementioned Delegations, the Director of Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division has authority to commence an enforcement action as the Complainant in this matter.

6. Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.5(c)(4) the following individual is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

W. Curtis Richardson Lead and Children's Health Section U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 (404) 562-8987.

#### III. Specific Allegations

- Respondent is a Lessor, as defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.103, of residential housing located at 1709F Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1710A Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1715D Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1717B Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1710C Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1714C Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1714C Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1728E Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; 1728E Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama; and 1712A Vestawood Courts, Vestavia Hills, Alabama. These residential housing units are "target housing," as defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.103.
- 8. Based on information obtained by EPA on or about January 30, 2009, relating to Respondent's contracts to lease its target housing described above, EPA alleges that Respondent violated Section 409 of TSCA and 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F as follows:
  - a. Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 745.113(b)(5), failed to include, in the contract as an attachment, a statement by the one or more Agents involved in the transaction to lease target housing that the Agent(s) has informed the Lessor of the Lessor's obligations, and that the Agent(s) is aware of his duty to ensure compliance.
    Respondent failed to include the appropriate information in at least ten leases.

#### IV. Consent Agreement

- 9. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations set forth above.
- 10. Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed Final Order accompanying the Consent Agreement.
- 11. Respondent consents to the assessment of the penalty proposed by EPA and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.
- 12. Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F.
- 13. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegations of the violations contained herein. This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States. Other than as expressed herein, neither EPA nor Complainant waives any right to bring an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.
- 14. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO. The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of TSCA.

#### V. Final Order

- 15. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of TWO THOUSAND AND EIGHTY **DOLLARS** (\$2,080) which shall be paid within thirty (30) days of the effective date.
- 16. Respondent shall remit the penalty payment by either a cashier's or certified check made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America."

4

Docket No.: TSCA-04-2011-2532(b)

## The Respondent shall note on the face of the check the Respondent's Name and the Docket Number associated with this CAFO.

The penalty payment shall be sent by one of the following methods to the address indentified for the method chosen:

Address for payment submittal using the United States Postal Service:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000.

Address for payment submittal using other mail service (e.g., Federal Express, United Parcel Service (UPS), DHL, etc.):

U.S. Bank 1005 Convention Plaza Mail Station SL-MO-C2GL St. Louis, Missouri 63101 Contact Person: Natalie Pearson (314) 418-4087.

17. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960;

W. Curtis Richardson Lead and Children's Health Section U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960; and

Saundi Wilson Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

18. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a

violation of this CAFO.

19. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts

owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a

delinquent claim. Interest will therefore begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the date

of entry of this CAFO, if the penalty is not paid by the date required. A charge will also

be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts.

In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principal amount not

paid within 90 days of the due date.

20. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.

21. This CAFO shall be binding upon the Respondent, its successors and assigns.

22. Each undersigned representative of the parties to this CAFO certifies that he or she is

fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and legally binds that

party to this CAFO.

THE REMAINDER OF THIS PAGE IS INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.

#### VI. Effective Date

23. The effective date of this CAFO shall be the date on which the CAFO is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

#### AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

| Respondent:<br>Docket No.:   | Vestawood Apartments, LLC<br>TSCA-04-2011-2532(b)             |         |         |         |
|------------------------------|---|---------|---------|---------|
| By: Joseph I Title: Legional | hongser   | Date: _ | 5/5/11  |         |
| Complainant:                 | U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECT                                    | ION AG  | ENCY    |         |
|                              | A. Kamber for  Janister, Director  es and Toxics  at Division | Date:   | 5/24/11 |         |
| APPROVED AND S               | O ORDERED this 26 day of                                      | mo      | 24      | , 2011. |

Vestawood Apartments
Docket No.: TSCA-04-2011-2532(b)

Susan B. Schub

Regional Judicial Officer

By:

Date: 5/24/11

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date set out below, I filed the original and one copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order and served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, In the Matter of Vestawood Apartments LLC, Docket Number: TSCA-04-2011-2532(b), to the addressees listed below.

Mr. Joseph Hiden Regional Manager Vestawood Apartments 1716 Vestawood Court Vestavia Hill, Alabama 35216 (via Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested)

CDO W. Curtis Richardson

(via EPA's internal mail)

Lead and Children's Health Section U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303

Robert Caplan (or assigned attorney)
Office of Environmental Accountability
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303

(via EPA's internal mail)

By:

Patricia A. Bullock Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, GA 30303 (404) 562-9511

### EPA ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE CONTROL NUMBER FORM

. . . .

| O BE COMPLETED BY THE ORIGINATION  (Attach a copy of the final order and transmittant)   | il letter to Defendant/Respondent)                     | $\mathcal{A}_{n}/n$                        |
|--|--|--|
| nis form was originated by:  | No. F.   | <u> </u>                                   |
|  | (Name)   | (Date)                                     |
| the Region 4, ORC, DEA   |  | at (404) 562-9304                          |
|  | fice)  | (Telephone Number)                         |
| Non-SF Judicial Order/Connent Decree USAO COLLECTS   |  | re Order/Consent Agreement<br>ECTS PAYMENT |
| SF Judicial Order/Connect Decree   | Oversight Bill Sent with bill                          | ling - Cost Package required:              |
| DOI COLLECTS   | Not sent with  | <b>SEE</b>                                 |
| Other Receivable   | Oversight Bil  | ling - Cost Package not required           |
| This is an original debt   | This is a mod  | ification                                  |
| Vestawood Apr.   | land the   | :  |
|  | r Company/Municipality making the                      |  |
| he Site Specific Superfund Account Number:   |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| ne IFMS Accounts Receivable Control Number is  | ļ.   | Date                                       |
| you have any questions, please call:   | of the Financial Management S                          | erilog at:                                 |
|  |  |  |
| ISTRIBUTION:   |  |  |
|  | tiached copy of the front page of the FINA             |  |
| . JUDICIAL ORDERS: Copies of this focus with we at should be mailed to:  | 2. Originating Office (EAD)                            | JUDICIAL ORDER                             |
| JUDICIAL ORDERS: Copies of this forms with we at should be unified to:  Debt Tracking Officer Environmental Enforcement Section  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                  | JUDICIAL ORDER                             |
|  | 2. Originating Office (EAD)                            | JUDICIAL ORDER                             |
| JUDICIAL ORDERS: Copies of this form with we at should be tracking Officer Environmental Enforcement Section Department of Juntice RM 1647 P.O. See 7611, Benjamin Franklin Station Washington, D.C. 28644 | Originating Office (EAD)     Designated Program Office | JUDICIAL ORDER                             |
| Debt Tracking Officer Environmental Enforcement Section Department of Justice RM 1647 P.O. Box 7611, Besignmin Franklin Station  | Originating Office (EAD)     Designated Program Office | LIUDICIAL ORDER                            |